The Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Baltimore Region

PUBLIC ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Wednesday, June 6, 2018
Baltimore Metropolitan Council
5:40 to 7:36 P.M.

MINUTES

Mr. Eric Norton, Chair, called the meeting to order at 5:40 p.m.

1. PRESENTATION: 2019-2022 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

Mr. Zach Kaufman provided members with an overview of the 2019-2022 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). The 2019-2022 TIP is the list of regional transportation projects requesting federal funding in the near term. It includes approximately $3.2 billion in proposed federal, state and local funding for highway, transit, bicycle and pedestrian projects during the next four years. The funding goes toward maintaining, operating and expanding the transportation system.

Mr. Kaufman reported that of the 128 projects in the TIP, four are new to the TIP: Capital Project Delivery Services in Baltimore City (12-1901-99); Mid-Atlantic Multimodal Transportation Hub in Baltimore County (13-1901-83); US 29/Broken Land Parkway Interchange and North South Connector Road in Howard County (16-1901-42); and MDOT's Baltimore-Washington Superconducting Maglev project (90-1901-99).

Mr. Kaufman shared highlights of the funding and noted that the Maryland Transit Administration (MTA), in lieu of a separate mandated public comment period has exercised its option to use the procedures of the BRTB's public involvement process for the 2019-2022 TIP. Lastly, Mr. Kaufman noted that the BRTB welcomes comments through June 25 and is hosting a regional transportation fair/TIP public meeting with BRTB member agencies on Tuesday, June 12 from 5:30 to 7:30 p.m. at BMC.

[Presentation − Baltimore Region FY 2019-2022 Transportation Improvement Program]

2. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS AND ACTION ITEMS

- **Policy and Legislation** − Mr. Will Cowan reported the subcommittee met on June 5 by conference call to discuss the 2019-2022 TIP. Mr. Cowan presented draft comments to the PAC which focused on five areas:

1500 Whetstone Way, Suite 300 ★ Baltimore, MD, 21230 ★ 410-732-0500 ★ www.baltometro.org
Voting: City of Annapolis, Anne Arundel County, Baltimore City, Baltimore County, Carroll County, Harford County, Howard County, Queen Anne's County, MD Department of Transportation and Harford Transit. Non-Voting: MD Department of the Environment, MD Department of Planning, and MD Transit Administration.

- o **Break out transit funding by capacity and preservation** – The PAC recommends that the TIP differentiate between transit capacity and transit preservation, similar to the highway capacity and highway preservation categories.
- o **Increase funding for transit services in line with the new RTA Transit Development Plan** – The jurisdictions that are part of the RTA have recently developed a new Transit Development Plan (TDP) that includes more frequent service and additional routes. The TIP does not appear to show increased funding programmed for these improvements. The PAC recommends increased funding to carry out the recommendations in the TDP.
- o **Increase funding for the Transportation Alternatives Program** – The PAC recommends increased funding as part of the Transportation Alternatives Program for bicycle and pedestrian facilities that connects residents to transit and job centers.
- o **Additional funding for transit improvements beyond FY 2019** – The PAC recommends that the BRTB continue to fund, beyond FY 2019, additional upgrades and preservation of the transit system in order to build upon the successes of BaltimoreLink.
- o **Improve the TIP environmental justice analysis** – Recommend the BRTB provide details on the environmental justice analysis done for the 2019-2022 TIP and that the BRTB work to improve the analysis for the next TIP, in line with the PAC's recommendations on an equity framework.

The PAC voted to support these recommendations via PAC Resolution #2018-03.

[PAC Resolution #2018-03 – Comments on 2019-2022 TIP]

In addition, Mr. Cowan reported that MDOT has updated their [Commuter Choice Maryland](#) program and shared highlights of the PAC's discussion in April 2017 about the possibility of BRTB members implementing the State Commuter Tax Credit programs within their organizations. The PAC reiterated a request for an update from MDOT as to the progress of implementing this benefit and the possibility of offering the benefit for state employees.

He also noted that Howard County is moving forward with an update to the Central Maryland Transit Development Plan by providing funding to purchase six new buses. However, the Anne Arundel County Council is still reviewing the plan and is possibly considering cuts to the #201 and #202 bus lines. Mr. Cowan wanted to provide this update to members who may be interested.

- **Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy** – Ms. Monica Haines Benkhedda thanked all of the PAC members for their support in raising $2,700 for the first Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy, as well as recruiting partners for the networking session and reaching out to hundreds of potential participants. Feedback on the event obtained by a survey of participants and debriefs with PAC members indicate the participants found the event useful. Ms. Haines Benkhedda also thanked all of the PAC members who volunteered with event set up, clean up and facilitation.

- **Public Involvement** – Mr. Paul Kowzan reported that the subcommittee met on May 30 to discuss the BRTB's Draft 2018 Public Participation Plan and debrief on the Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy. The subcommittee recommends the BRTB continue to implement the Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy as a successful tool for public education and engagement. The group suggested that the next event be held in Fall 2018 in Anne Arundel or Howard Counties and then plan additional trainings in other jurisdictions 1-2 times per year. The PAC voted to support this recommendation via #PAC Resolution #2018-04.

  Mr. Todd Lang asked that the subcommittee work with staff to identify potential dates, locations, and a budget for additional Every Voice Counts Transportation Academies. Ms. Haines Benkhedda will work with the subcommittee on this request.

[PAC Resolution #2018-04 – Recommendation on Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy]

- **Transportation Equity** – Mr. Norton reported the subcommittee met on May 15 to finalize the request by staff for additional information on various equity examples. Mr. Norton explained that through the subcommittee's review and discussion of the various examples, the subcommittee recognizes that each MPO is different, numerous approaches are available, and the task of unpacking each MPOs specific equity strategies and applying them to the Baltimore region is one that requires significant time and attention. Therefore, the subcommittee recommended the BRTB form an equity committee consisting of BRTB members, PAC members, elected officials, affected stakeholders, leaders from area nonprofits and businesses, and other residents. The PAC voted to support the equity subcommittee recommendations via PAC Resolution #2018-05.

[PAC Resolution #2018-05 – Equity Briefing]

3. UPDATE TO PAC BYLAWS

Due to time constraints, the PAC postponed this item until the next PAC meeting.

4. PRESENTATION: TRANSPORTATION CAMP 2018

Due to time constraints, the PAC postponed this presentation until the next PAC meeting.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The PAC approved the May 2018 minutes.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

Highlights of the May 22 BRTB meeting include a presentation on a US 1 Safety Evaluation in Howard County in response to a spike in the number of pedestrian fatalities in the corridor, as well as increasing residential and mixed-use development in this historically commercial and

industrial corridor. Mr. Ramond Robinson of Anne Arundel County also shared details on the formation and mission of the Anne Arundel Transportation Commission. BRTB minutes and a list of upcoming events are online at baltometro.org.

The meeting adjourned at 7:36 P.M.

ATTENDANCE

Members
Michael Bishop – Resident, Baltimore City   *Proxy Designated by: Michael Davis*
William Cowan – South Baltimore Neighborhood Association
Janet Eveland – Resident, Baltimore City
Benjamin Groff – Resident, Baltimore City
Tafadzwa Gwitira – Resident, Baltimore City
Yvette Hicks – Resident, Baltimore County
Mark Howard – Resident, Baltimore County
Paul Kowzan III – Broadway Area Business Association
Dick Ladd – Resident, Anne Arundel County
Eric Norton – Central Maryland Transportation Alliance   *Proxy Designated by: Jed Weeks*
Karen Olsen – Resident, Baltimore County
Rita Ossiander – Resident, Baltimore County   *Proxy Designated by: Mark Lotz*
Audrey Sellers – Accessible Resources for Independence, Inc.
Jennifer Weeks – Resident, Baltimore County
Daniel Yi – Resident, Howard County

Staff and Guests
Monica B. Haines Benkhedda – Baltimore Metropolitan Council (BMC)
Todd Lang – BMC

A RESOLUTION REGARDING
THE 2019-2022 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM (TIP)
BY THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PAC) OF THE BRTB

WHEREAS, the BRTB, the Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Baltimore region responsible for transportation planning and policy making for the Baltimore region; and

WHEREAS, the PAC serves as an advisory body to the BRTB, charged with providing independent, region oriented citizen advice to the BRTB on issues related to the development of the Baltimore Regional Transportation Plan, Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP), Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and amendments that affect the region's conformity with federal air quality requirements, the public involvement process, regionally significant land use issues, and other regional transportation-related issues, as appropriate, promotes public awareness and participation in the regional transportation planning process and promotes equity in the regional transportation planning process; and

WHEREAS, the PAC has reviewed and discussed the *2019-2022 Transportation Improvement Program* (TIP);

THEREFORE, be it resolved, the PAC submits the following comments:

- **Breakout transit funding by capacity and preservation** – The PAC recommends that the TIP differentiate between transit capacity and transit preservation, similarly to the highway capacity and highway preservation categories.
- **Increase funding for transit services in line with the new RTA Transit Development Plan** – The jurisdictions that are part of the RTA have recently developed a new Transit Development Plan (TDP) that includes more frequent service and additional routes. The TIP does not appear to show increased funding programmed for these improvements. The PAC recommends increased funding to carry out the recommendations in the TDP.
- **Increase funding for the Transportation Alternatives Program** – The PAC recommends increased funding as part of the Transportation Alternatives Program for bicycle and pedestrian facilities that connects residents to transit and job centers.
- **Additional funding for transit improvements beyond FY2019** – The PAC recommends that the BRTB continue to fund, beyond FY 2019, additional upgrades and preservation of the transit system in order to build upon the successes of BaltimoreLink.
- **Improve the TIP environmental justice analysis** – Recommend the BRTB provide details on the environmental justice analysis done for the 2019-2022 TIP and that the BRTB work to improve the analysis for the next TIP, in line with the PAC's recommendations on an equity framework.

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, the PAC thanks the BRTB for this opportunity to participate by sharing comments on these amendments. The PAC thanks the BRTB staff for facilitating its participation.

Submitted by:

Eric Norton
Chair, BRTB Public Advisory Committee

**A RESOLUTION REGARDING
EVERY VOICE COUNTS TRANSPORTATION ACADEMY
BY THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PAC) OF THE BRTB**

WHEREAS, the BRTB, the Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Baltimore region responsible for transportation planning and policy making for the Baltimore region; and

WHEREAS, the PAC serves as an advisory body to the BRTB, charged with providing independent, region oriented citizen advice to the BRTB on issues related to the development of the Baltimore Regional Transportation Plan, Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP), Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and amendments that affect the region's conformity with federal air quality requirements, the public involvement process, regionally significant land use issues, and other regional transportation-related issues, as appropriate, promotes public awareness and participation in the regional transportation planning process and promotes equity in the regional transportation planning process; and

WHEREAS, the PAC has discussed the success of the inaugural Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy;

THEREFORE, be it resolved, the PAC recommends the BRTB continue to implement the Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy as a successful tool for public education and engagement. The PAC further recommends the BRTB and BMC schedule the next event in Fall 2018 in Anne Arundel or Howard Counties and then plan additional trainings in other jurisdictions 1-2 times per year.

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, the PAC thanks the BRTB for this opportunity to enhance public outreach and education by bringing the Every Voice Counts Transportation Academy to the Baltimore region. The PAC thanks the BRTB staff for facilitating its participation.

Submitted by:

Eric Norton
Chair, BRTB Public Advisory Committee

**A RESOLUTION REGARDING
TRANSPORTATION EQUITY
BY THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PAC) OF THE BRTB**

WHEREAS, the BRTB, the Metropolitan Planning Organization for the Baltimore region responsible for transportation planning and policy making for the Baltimore region; and

WHEREAS, the PAC serves as an advisory body to the BRTB, charged with providing independent, region oriented citizen advice to the BRTB on issues related to the development of the Baltimore Regional Transportation Plan, Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP), Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) and amendments that affect the region's conformity with federal air quality requirements, the public involvement process, regionally significant land use issues, and other regional transportation-related issues, as appropriate, promotes public awareness and participation in the regional transportation planning process and promotes equity in the regional transportation planning process; and

WHEREAS, the PAC has researched and discussed examples of how other MPOs are incorporating an equity lens into their work and specific programs that accomplish the goal of ensuring equity.

THEREFORE, be it resolved, the PAC submits the attached research and recommendations;

BE IT FINALLY RESOLVED, the PAC thanks the BRTB for this opportunity to promote transportation equity, in line with its mission. The PAC thanks the BRTB staff for facilitating its participation in the regional planning process.

Submitted by:

Eric Norton
Chair, BRTB Public Advisory Committee

EQUITY BRIEFING

The BRTB Public Advisory Committee presented to the BRTB on December 19, 2017 a document entitled Defining Equity, outlining a definition of equity as the PAC feels it could be applied to the BRTB's Baltimore region planning activities, as well as specific examples of the kinds of goals that would arise from properly incorporating an equity framework.

Staff has requested more detailed information about how other MPOs are incorporating an equity lens into their work and specific programs that accomplish the goal of ensuring equity.

The examples of equity outlined below are just several examples of how MPOs and other government agencies are taking specific steps to incorporate an equity framework into outreach, public engagement, plans, metrics and analysis, work products, and more. Because each MPO is different, and because numerous approaches are available, the task of unpacking each MPOs specific equity strategies and applying them to the Baltimore region is one that requires significant time and attention.

Therefore, the PAC recommends the BRTB form an equity committee consisting of BRTB members, PAC members, elected officials, affected stakeholders, leaders from area nonprofits and businesses, and other residents. The purpose of the committee would be to:

- · Review examples of how MPO's define equity
- · Identify goals for equity in BRTB decision-making process
- · Examine performance measures and outcomes on equity
- · Develop an equity framework for BRTB work products, including, but not limited to, the long-range plan, the short-range plan, amendments, and the UPWP.

The PAC thanks the BRTB for this opportunity to provide recommendations and BMC staff for facilitating its participation.

Submitted by:

Eric Norton
Chair, BRTB Public Advisory Committee

PUGET SOUND REGIONAL COUNCIL (SEATTLE MPO)

psrc.org/sites/default/files/equoppsusreport2.pdf

Examples:

- **Growing Transit Communities Strategy** - The Regional Transit-Oriented Development Implementation Program convenes partners from across the region and across sectors to develop and implement strategies to promote equitable TOD.
    - Performance Monitoring - tracking data on population, housing, and job growth in the transit community study areas
    - Transit Supportive Planning Toolkit

- **Equity Metrics** - Updated modeling to allow more detailed equity and health analysis, such as:
    - Costs and travel time by income and person/household type (ex: Average Commute Time of higher / lower income)
    - Share of income spent on transportation
    - Active transportation by person types

- **Planning for Whole Communities Toolkit** -25 resource guides describing specific tools and how to put them to work at the local level. Topics include Opportunity Mapping, Community engagement tools, Pedestrian-Oriented Design, Safe Routes to School, Special Needs Transportation, Transit-Oriented Development, Parking Management, etc.

BOSTON REGION MPO

ctps.org/equity

Examples:

- The Boston MPO equity program incorporates the following into their UPWP, TIP, LRTP, PPP, and other work products:
    - Providing TE populations with the opportunity to participate in the MPO's transportation-planning and decision-making processes
    - Ensuring that minority and low-income populations receive a fair share of the MPO's transportation investments, and are not subject to undue burdens as a result of these investments
    - Analyzing the impacts of MPO-funded projects on low-income and minority protected populations
    - Considering demographic equity methodically when selecting studies and projects to be funded by the MPO

- Survey on Transportation Equity - "If you would like the MPO to be aware of transportation equity issues that you face, please take a moment to tell us about your needs by completing the MPO's Transportation Equity Survey."

- Performance Dashboard: The MPO's Performance Dashboard visualizes data on the current state of transportation in the Boston region. It includes demographic data, such as minority population, household income, employment, and disability.

- Meet the MPO staff Open House as part of UPWP development process

- Includes Female-headed households with children and Youth (under age 18) in equity analysis.

METCOUNCIL (MINNEAPOLIS-ST. PAUL)
metrocouncil.org/About-Us/why-we-matter/Equity.aspx

Examples:

- **Equity Outcome in Thrive MSP 2040** - MetCouncil identified equity as one of five key regional outcomes from Thrive MSP 2040, alongside stewardship, prosperity, livability and sustainability. In Thrive MSP 2040, the Metropolitan Council commits to using equity as a lens to evaluate its operations, planning and investments. The Council also commits to exploring its authority to use its resources and roles to mitigate the place-based dimension of racial, ethnic and income-based disparities.
  - *Equity Outcome* - Equity connects all residents to opportunity and creates viable housing, transportation, and recreation options for people of all races, ethnicities, incomes and abilities so that all communities share the opportunities and challenges of growth and change.
  - *Equity Prioritization Criteria in LRTP* - In line with the equity outcome included in Thrive MSP 2040, the 2040 Transportation Policy Plan strategies include equity among the criteria for prioritizing transportation spending across the system.
  - *Accessibility Analysis of Investments* - An analysis of changes in highway and transit accessibility to jobs under the Current Revenue Scenario revealed larger improvements to accessibility for people of color as compared to the general population and people with low incomes.
  - Equity as Technical Investment Factor in Regional Transit Service Improvement Plan
  - Lists access to jobs and opportunity is an issue of equity.

- **Equity Advisory Committee** - The Metropolitan Council created an Equity Advisory Committee with 21 members, four of which are sitting MetCouncil members. The two co-chairs are one MetCouncil member and one member of the community. Terms are staggered so approximately half the members are up for reappointment every two years. Committee work includes: how the Council implements the equity commitments in Thrive MSP 2040; an annual work plan reflecting both policy questions from the full Metropolitan Council and policy topics identified by the committee.

- Added equity items to work program to "fully integrate equity analysis into the center of the planning process."

  Work activities include:
  - Evaluate how the region distributes federal transportation funding.
  - Study potential disparities in preservation and maintenance spending and transportation facility condition by race/ethnicity and income
  - Study potential disparities in safety outcomes by race/ethnicity and income
  - Develop more robust methods of analyzing the benefits and impacts of transportation investments by race/ethnicity and income to aid in using equity as a prioritization factor

  Program activities include:
  - Bus Stop Enhancements
  - Student Internship Program
  - Mechanic Training Program
  - Spanish Classes for Transit Operators and Transit Police

- MetCouncil released Disparities Unmasked: The Twin Cities Metro in 2014, which looked at quality of life indicators for the region and examined disparities by race.

BALTIMORE CITY, DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, OFFICE OF SUSTAINABILITY

Examples:

Equity in Planning Committee
planning.baltimorecity.gov/equity-planning-committee#Defining Equity

- The City of Baltimore's Department of Planning staff created and convenes an Equity in Planning Committee (EIPC).

- The EIPC's equity lens considers four overarching areas of equity. For any policy or project, decision makers should consider:

  - Structural Equity – *What historic advantages or disadvantages have affected residents in the given community?*

  - Procedural Equity – *How are residents who have been historically excluded from planning processes being authentically included in the planning, implementation, and evaluation of the proposed policy or project?*

  - Distributional Equity – *Does the distribution of civic resources and investment explicitly account for potential racially disparate outcomes?*

  - Transgenerational Equity – *Does the policy or project result in unfair burdens on future generations?*

Baltimore Sustainability Plan Proposed Draft (2018)
baltimoresustainability.org

Measuring success
- Track increases in transit on-time performance.
- Track the number of miles of bicycle lanes installed each year, both overall as well as within neighborhoods where residents have the lowest rates of car access.
- Track an increase in residents' access to high frequency transit, measured in terms of number of residents served by transit options less than one-quarter mile from their home; seek a 10 percent annual increase.
- Measure and publish data on travel time, reliability, and average speed of transit throughout corridors where dedicated lanes and priority bus travel have been implemented. Data to include breakdown by neighborhood.
- Measure the number of bicyclists using facilities using annual counts.
- Measure the number of riders using the bus system.

TOOLS FOR MEASURING ACCESSIBILITY IN AN EQUITY FRAMEWORK

https://www.cnu.org/sites/default/files/ssti_transpo_equity.pdf

Four dimensions of equity are:
- Accessibility
- Affordability
- Health and safety
- Procedural equity

Accessibility measures can be used to:
- evaluate if the existing system or proposed changes to the system cause disparities between EJ and non-EJ groups.
- illuminate patterns of accessibility across different communities and geographic areas;
- Comparing accessibility for different transportation modes or demographic groups;
- Identifying accessibility gaps due to poor transit coverage or transportation network connectivity;
- Evaluating projects, policies, and other interventions by modeling changes in accessibility under different scenarios (e.g., by adding or removing network connections, transit lines, or interventions like ramp metering)